

**“Co-spatiality: Changing rules of double use, excluding, inviting, imagining”**

International conference | 11.-13. November 2020 | Erfurt

Organisers: Elisa Iori, Susanne Rau, Jörg Rüpke

---

Sara Keller

**"Tangible and imagined spatialities around water: The Munsar lake as a study case of the South Asian hydro-space (Viramgam, India, 11<sup>th</sup>-12<sup>th</sup> century)"**

The monumental hydraulic architecture of Western India counts amongst the most important vestiges of the pre-modern city, sometimes exceeding in size and artistic quality other major architectural production of the time such as fortifications, palaces and places of worship. Stepwells and lakes are grandiose staging sets for a large panel of activities including travel and commercial function (as caravan stop-offs), female sociabilities, places of rituals and religious practices (*puja*-s, ritual bath, idol immersion, etc.) and leisure areas (gardens, music and dance performances etc.).

The paper aims to look at the multiple usages of water-related places on the *longue durée*, from the early middle age to periods of greater confessional divides, especially after the introduction of a stable Muslim rule during the 15<sup>th</sup> century. While the Indian city is regarded as a highly compartmented space with clearly distinct residential areas following social categories, the urban waterscape appears in contrary as a place of space sharing. The concept of co-spatiality will help conceptualise the complex condition of space sharing in the context of a wide range of functions and confessions. How is the space sharing organised, can a time and/or space repartition be identified? How dynamic and how normalized was this repartition? Can the hydro-space of the Western Indian city, from the Muzaffarid period onwards, be understood as a Foucaultian heterotopia? Moreover, looking at the presence of remarkable water structures in non-urban areas, the paper will discuss whether the spread of urbanity outside the formal urban area introduced co-spatiality outside the city walls.

---

Supriya Chaudhuri

**“Between River and Street: the Ghāt or landing-stage as overlapping space”**

This paper will focus on the ghāt, a typical feature of the Indian landscape, having special sanctity in cities along the course of the Gangā like Varānasi or Allāhabād (Prayāgrāj). The term ghāt is traditionally used to describe built (usually stone) steps leading down to a river or pond to enable access to the water for bathers, for boats to be moored and take on passengers, and for a variety of sacred rituals linked to Hindu life and death (including cremation) to be performed. The Hindu sense of the ghāt as a threshold, a liminal space between land and water, life and death, is powerfully recorded in literature and art. Because ghāts serve a multiplicity of functions: as bathing areas, as

sites for athletic exercise, musical performance, and sacred rites (in Varanasi, they are focal points for both pilgrimage and tourism), they carry complicated histories of building or settlement, patronage, legal disputes over title and access, and the sedimentation of social and religious life. The paper will examine some of these histories.

---

Richard Gordon

### **"The *imaginaire* of the Roman amphitheatre at Carthage: narratives in competition"**

It is practically impossible to identify ancient spaces that fulfil the requirements of the CfP and for which there is sufficient evidence to fill a paper of 20pp. The paper takes the amphitheatre of Roman Carthage as a focus but adduces materials from elsewhere, notably from the Flavian amphitheatre in Rome.

The amphitheatre of Carthage has been thoroughly plundered, but a reliable architectural history can be written on the basis of excavations conducted since the 1980s. For an account as a multi-layered space, however, we need information of a different order. As a site for mass public entertainment (estimated at 30,000 spectators), such an amphitheatre was an instrumental space in two senses: it was a stage for gladiatorial games, for beast-hunts, and for public executions; and it was a major site of elite self-representation, starting (at Rome) with the emperor's own largesse and personal appearances. At the same time games were inaugurated with sacrifices, while individual incidents and executions recalled – and re-staged – mythological narratives. However, the amphitheatre was also used a preferred site for depositing curses to influence the success of beast-hunters, and as a discursive arena for Christian attacks on spectacles and the glorification of martyrdom.

---

Amira K. Bennison

### **"The multiple functions of the Baḥā'ir estates of the Almohads in twelfth-century Iberia and the Maghrib"**

The market in the mosque courtyard is probably the 'double-use' most often cited for medieval western Islamic cities. The fulminations of Ibn 'Abdūn about traders in the great mosque in eleventh-century Seville show this kind of encroachment, as does his concern about female socialising in cemeteries. If we look at non-religious spaces, however, textual evidence becomes more sparse. One area of interest to me is royal space which encompassed both religious and non-religious areas, and included intramural palaces and plazas as well as suburban estates. The latter may not have been accessible to a massive variety of people within medieval society but they did have multiple uses which could at times gain ritual significance. The estates which I will consider in this paper are those about which we have most evidence in the form of textual descriptions of events occurring within them, namely the baḥā'ir (sing. buḥayra) constructed by the Almohads outside several twelfth-century cities in the Maghrib and Iberia, including Marrakesh and Seville. The current Menara and Agdal park areas in Marrakesh are the descendants of these Almohad estates whose original usage

is colourfully described by Ibn Šāhib al-Šalāt, a Sevillian servant of the Almohads who wrote a partially extant history of the early Almohad era. The distinguishing characteristic of a buḥayra was a large artificial lake or reservoir from which the estates took their Almohad-era name (buḥayra = lake). They were used for the production of fruits and other foodstuffs which could be consumed or sold by the palace but also for caliphal recreation, the training of Almohad troops, and the hosting of large numbers of troops prior to military campaigns. In the latter case, the highly ideological character of the Almohad state was expressed through feasting and religiously-inflected speeches, transforming the buḥayra temporarily into a religio-political arena.

---

Elisa Iori

### **“Spatialising Buddhist practices in Gandharan urban spaces”**

Whereas the hundreds of monumental Buddhist remains marking countryside and peri-urban areas of ancient India easily evoke in our mind the image of a sacral landscape, the sacral geography of lived Buddhist religion is far less perceptible when it comes to the cityscape.

The general difficulty in tracking and interpreting the material traces of ritual activities in domestic contexts, the almost exclusive attention paid to places of cult with a “normative” Buddhist layout in public space, together with the current academic unconcern for the archaeology of Early Historic urban sites prevent us to gain insights into this matter.

Despite these challenges, the discovery of urban places of ritual activities in both residential units and public spaces within the neighborhood of the SW corner of the city of Barikot (Swat, NW Pakistan) offers the opportunity to have a close-up on (a) how religious spatial strategies come into play in both congested public areas and domestic spaces, (b) how topographical separate religious spaces (domestic/public, urban/rural) meaningfully interact with each other, (c) to what extent the complexity of urban social and political practices interlocks and negotiate with spaces of religious and daily life.

The potential coexistence inside the same urban space of overlapping metric systems conversing with each other in a multiplicity of spatial and temporal combinations seems to provide a fertile ground for an analysis drawn on the concept of cospatiality.

---

Susanne Rau

## **"The market and the city: Mercantile and religious entanglements in cities along the Malabar coast (medieval, early modern)"**

The project pursues an almost impossible goal: to describe a bazaar in its spatio-temporal dimensions. Bazaars are typically commercial zones in urban centres and are recognisable by a certain architectural structure and specific practices. The word seems to originate from Middle Persian (*wāzār*). Bazaars are particularly common in the Arabic world and in Islamic influenced cities. A number of recent studies have already pointed out that bazaars are usually not clearly delineated areas of a city, but are interwoven in many ways with other areas inside and outside a city, that they have flowing, porous boundaries and are often closely connected with other institutions of urban Islamic culture. One should speak here less of segmentation than of overlapping or interlocking spaces.

As a case study, the contribution will deal with bazaars in cities along the Malabar Coast on the Indian subcontinent, in particular the city of Calicut, whose trade was for many centuries in the hands of the Arabs, who settled there (temporarily, periodically or even long-term) and also practised their (Islamic) faith there. Other groups followed suit and contributed to the city's development into a global hub of trade in the 14<sup>th</sup> century. The paper will address questions about the location and arrangement of the architectural elements of the bazaar in relation to the topography of the city as a whole, as well as accessibility, temporality of trade, the many functions of the bazaar and its interrelationship with other areas of urban life, especially religious life.

The co-presence of various religious groups and their commercial activities have contributed significantly to the development and rise of the city. In contrast to the older discussion in European historiography, which for a long time assumed that many cities emerged from so-called market places ("Markortorte"), the thesis is that both trade and religion shaped the city on the Arabian Sea and contributed to its development. Finally, it should be discussed whether this is a specific feature of late medieval and early modern cities and what role religion plays in today's trade and financial centres ("global cities").

---

Abdul Nasir

## **"Cosmopolitanism in microspaces: the structure and function of *Akams* of Kuttichira in Calicut"**

*Akams* are medieval residential houses of the Muslims in the city of Calicut. Similar residential structures could also be seen at important coastal centers of Northern Malabar. It seems to be an indication to the early settlements and family structure of Muslims in the city of Calicut. Since Calicut had been one of the pivotal centers of Indian Ocean Trade Networks during the pre-colonial period, the traders from different corners of the world especially from Arabian Peninsula and Africa had frequented at Calicut.

As a centre of brisk trade and commercial activity, Calicut had functioned as a port-of-trade during the medieval period. So, it enjoyed institutional support enormously in its function. Various sections and functionaries who were involved had been accommodated in the emerging city such as artisans, foreign traders, religious groups etc. As a major group who engaged in the profitable trading activity, the Muslims had been given favourable considerations in Calicut. Therefore, separated areas, sometimes free land with various prerogatives, had been assigned to Muslim traders and religious leaders by the ruling authorities in Calicut. So the formation of Akams should be analysed in this background. Akams are not a pars pro toto or miniature form of the city scape instead it occupied an integral component of the Calicut as an emerging city in the medieval period. Akams had also been there at various other port centres of Northern Kerala including Kannur city, Koyilandi (few diaspora settlement areas in the Malabar coast) Interaction between these centres also be discussed to know the growth and development of Akams in the city of Calicut. Spatial arrangement inside the Akams may reveal many aspects of its functions with regards to the city life.

These houses (*Akams*) possess a distinctive structure with high compound walls and a typical *spatial* arrangement inside. These are reported to have been constructed by/for the medieval Muslim merchant families who thronged here from the different part of the Indian ocean world. The oceanic Muslim diaspora built up their life world here without creating tensions in the local setting in the region and at the same time preserving the Islamic idioms of life structured in a wider space. Attempts have been made to explain the segmentation and special arrangements inside these *Akams* in terms of the social practice of *Marumakkathayam* (matrilineal system) peculiar to the Muslims of coastal areas of Malabar. But it is important that the structures and functions of these *Akams* defined and practiced at within an emerging cityscape that all through its history accommodated people from different regions and religion. An analysis of structures, functions of these *Akams* and its artistic and other representations allow us to identify the nuances of historical development of the multiple spaces around the *Akams*.

---

Emiliano Rubens Urciuoli

### **“The Poverty Plateau. The Space of the Urban Street Poor in Early Christian Literature”**

The rise of cities was a boost in the history of human inequality. From a deep-historical, evolutionary point of view, the argument that, “even when compared with the most dire urban poverty, conditions in rural areas are usually worse” (Glaeser) is a feeble excuse. Cities, past and present, are generators of poverty both outside and inside their (more or less evanescent) boundaries. Cities starve the farmers, lure the immigrants into misery, and pauperize segments of homegrown population on the same day, like restless extractive machines working at full speed. Moreover, as Simmel first noticed and Bong Joon-ho put crudely on screen (*Parasite* 2019), if you are poor you are not inhabiting the same city of your neighboring rich; once you are homeless, you ‘fall in’ (tomber dans la rue) and dwell where better-fed and -housed others may at worst stumble and usually walk by without even seeing you. The city street is a layered territory of superposed plan(e)s of existence with only a few passages in-between – whether these are visual, olfactory, or interactional contact zones.

As universal urban agents transiently sharing one of these in-between, beggars and almsgivers are also urban types that span the history of the inter-spatiality between the city of the rich and the city of the poor. Such history has a critical turning point which dates back to early Christ religion and the related urban textual production. Aim of this paper is to sift through two centuries of early Christian literature in order to blend together the notion of co-spatiality and the history of the urban poor and see what happens. As shown by Peter Brown and Susan Holman respectively, the rise and professionalization of the urban Christian clergy (the 'holy poor') in late antique Mediterranean cities is intertwined with the emergence and thematization of the urban destitute (the 'real poor'), whereas the urban street is the place where the difference between holy and real poverty is made visible and works to refigure power structures within the Roman imperial society. However, this well-founded narrative has never been spatialized to the point of putting in full view the multifarious arrangements of same portions of urban space that are produced by 'the invention of the poor' on the part of Christian clerics. Surveying diverse urban setting from 3rd-century Rome to late 4th-century Cappadocia, the paper will show how and to what extent the breakthrough in the social imagination of poverty implied the superposition of new urban space, the display of the destitute went hand in hand with the refashioning of the street.

---

Dietmar Mieth

### **“The Same Spaces tell Different Religious Stories: Five examples of co-spatialities in Paris about 1300”**

Magister Aegidius Romanus (Paris) wrote before 1300 „De regimine principum“ for King Philipp IV of France. (1295-1314) The Franciscan Durand de Champagne wrote about 1300 the „Speculum dominarum“, the first Compendium of a responsible government for a Queen, Jeanne de Champagne (+1305). The Queen recommended the translation in French „Le miroir des dames“. The social state of the nobility was the base for this concept. A caricature of moral estates of this time delivers the “Roman de Fauvel” de Gervès du Buis, about 1300, in which the moral hypocrisy is denounced in combination with the vices.

In the literary female circles the concept of nobility was transformed into “moraliteit/morality”. The concept of a “noble soul” as a spiritual transformation can be found in the spirituality of the beguines. The „Miroir des simples âmes“, written by the beguine Marguerite Porete implies a critical concept of virtues as female services. Under the objection of denying the virtues and to allow the libertinage resp. fornication she was burned in Paris 1310 by the inquisition.

The conceptions of social responsibility, virtues, social state and gender in these “Miroirs” (= compendia) were different. They raise not only the question of gender but also the question of different religious behavior depending from different social and religious movements and the reaction of different powers on these movements. This contribution will analyze the background of such differences in social and religious institutions in Paris and the tensions between them.

---

Martin Christ

### **"The Bedchamber as a Shared Space in Early Modern Europe"**

While in modern societies, the bedroom is a space understood as a personal space, in early modern Europe this was not the case. In many cases, the room in which a bed was located was highly permeable and frequented by a large range of people, if there was a room specifically for sleeping at all. The paper discusses if and how the concept of cospatiality can be applied on this kind of micro level. Connected to these broader reflections is the question, if the objects, people and spatial arrangements in the bedchamber resulted in an "urbanized bedroom" or a distinctly "urban use" of that room. The contribution shows how the multiple people who gathered in the bedchamber changed its meaning and functions, and how this was not only a space with multiple uses, but a space that had a high degree of cospatiality. Indeed, not only the bedchamber had features of cospatiality, but the bed itself was a space shared by multiple people for many purposes. The paper discusses, in particular, how the dynamics around the bedchamber changed, when multiple actors were present there, for example when physicians, clerics, family and friends gathered around the deathbed, or when a female-only space was created during childbirth. In this way, the multi-layered nature of the bedchamber and its relation to cospatiality as well as the drawing of boundaries between different uses and groups as a way to avoid cospatiality can be analysed.

---

Beat Kümin

### **"Tower Ball Deposits and Urban Spaces in the German Lands"**

This proposal focuses on the spatial and temporal implications of a widespread custom in Central Europe. From the late Middle Ages right up to the present, representatives of user communities have deposited chronicles and objects in *Turmkuugeln* located at the top of spires and towers of major buildings such as churches, town halls and city gates. The evidence can date back to the original construction, with further items added on the occasion of subsequent repairs, often with the explicit intention to inform posterity. In certain cases, therefore, such spheres contain multiple layers of materials stretching over several centuries.

The conference theme of co-spatiality raises a series of pertinent questions: given that tower balls occupied liminal positions between earth and heaven, should they be seen as constituting secular or religious spaces or both at the same time? Were their functions mainly protective / metaphysical, comparable to *Bauopfer*, or akin to those of practical / 'secular' *Erinnerungsorte*, aimed at the evocation of specific events / people with a view to fostering the 'right' kinds of collective identities? Given the existence of multiple, contrasting and sometimes even secret deposits, who was actually in charge of these communications – individual scribes, social elites or entire local communities? With hindsight, furthermore, could modern scholarship interpret deposits as chains of commemorative 'booster points', allowing the communicative memory (Jan & Aleida Assmann) of later generations to reach much further back than the regular horizon of less than a century? Would a systematic analysis of all preserved evidence allow a radically different reconstitution of local topographies from multiple

(communal, parochial, individual) perspectives? And, last but not least, was there anything particularly 'urban' about the phenomenon?

This paper presents preliminary results from a larger project on tower ball deposits in Austria, Germany and Switzerland, including cities like Innsbruck, Dresden and Lucerne. Given similar deposits in the countryside, the presentation will also reflect on the specific characteristics of townscape environments such as greater differentiation of buildings and more complex spatial constellations.

---

Maureen Attali

### **"Temple ruins versus Temple Mount: Constructing two distinct theological spaces in Late Ancient Jerusalem"**

In Late Antiquity, the site of the Jewish Temple, destroyed between 70 and 135 C.E., functioned as a liminal space whose status was instrumental in religious polemics. While the "temple ruins" and the "Temple Mount" occupied the same expanse and designated the same architectural features, they referred to different theological spaces, the former Christian and the later Jewish.

The site, whose inclusion inside the pomerium of the Roman colony is still debated among scholars, lay at least partially in ruins all through Antiquity. From 325 onwards, the theological construct of Jerusalem as a Christian Holy city required its exclusion. Even though the martyrdom of several prominent Christian figure was located there, no church was ever erected on the site; it was not represented on the Madaba mosaic, a late Vith century map of the Christian Holy Land. When mentioned in Christians texts, the site symbolizes Otherness and serves as a visual reminder of Judaism's demise. As such, Christian pilgrimage to the temple ruins was generally considered favorably by Church Fathers for its educational purpose.

At the same time, Rabbinic Literature attests to a contrary evolution. Not only did the sacredness of the Temple survive its destruction: it was geographically extended to encompass the whole "Temple Mount". Specific rituals were to be observed not only when Jews visited the enlarged site, but also when they laid eyes on it. Through discourse and practices, Rabbinic authorities aimed at creating a Jewish counter-city, in order to maintain a visible presence in Jerusalem even when the ban on Jewish residence within the city limits was enforced.

Those two theological spaces interacted during Jewish communal pilgrimages to the Temple Mount. Only alluded to in Talmudic Literature, such events were described in length in at least two Christian texts, written by Jerome and the anonymous author of the Syriac Life of Barsauma. Even though the latter account may be fictional, most commentators agree on the historicity of this pilgrimage, which can be interpreted as a case of Christian "antagonistic tolerance" (R.M. Hayden, 2002). On the 9 of Ab, the day of the annual commemoration of Temple's destruction, Jews exceptionally marched through the Christian city while performing ostentatious mourning rituals. The function of this display can only be fully understood in its urban context. By expressing and provoking a various array

of emotions, it served to reinforce both Christian and Jewish definition of the city and of its theological meaning.

---

Monica L. Smith

### **"Seeing and un-seeing others' religions: The dilemma of urban spaces"**

Much of the archaeological discussion of ancient cities and the material analysis of modern cities revolves around obvious physical "facts" such as buildings, streets, and open spaces. These cosmopolitan streetscapes are differently used and influenced by people of different subcommunities within the urban milieu, and their diversity of architecture and spaces result in a variety of choices and practices. Compared to economic, social, and political actions in cities, ritual activities probably incur the least choice, because once individuals are within a particular ritual or religious tradition there is little active seeking for alternatives. Yet the architecture and spaces of others' religious traditions are still part of the streetscape of urbanism. How do people learn to "un-see" those elements of the urban sphere that are not of relevance to them? And how does the process of "unseeing" become increasingly prevalent in non-religious domains as a result of the practice incurred through religious activities and practices? The paper will evaluate these questions through the historical traditions of the mid-first millennium BC in the Indian subcontinent, when there was the simultaneous existence of Buddhist, Jain, Ajivika, and Vedic traditions that were all beginning to be manifested in distinct architectural forms in and around urban areas.

---

Cristiana Facchini

### **"Religious diversity and the city: an inquiry into the long nineteenth century"**

Mainly defined as a historical phase of secularization where religion became increasingly irrelevant or marginal, the nineteenth century was also characterized by a great deal of urban restyling, which implied also a novel and more inclusive notion of citizenship defined by a new theory of religious tolerance, rooted in the notion of the separation between state and church.

Focusing on some port cities (Trieste, Livorno, Salonika and Alexandria) this article seeks to analyse how religious diversity was managed and transformed against the backdrop of the rise of both national cultures and 'secularism'. 'Port cities' have been usually conceived as 'cosmopolitan' urban hubs characterized by the presence of different groups, who inhabited the urban space. In some cases, these groups lived as 'enclave communities', relatively segregated and self-referential but capable of creating forms of transnational networks; in other instances, the boundaries among each group were more easily crossed through a myriad of religious, social and economic practices that varied accordingly.

As cultures of modernity developed, new urban places of socialization appeared (cafes, theatres, schools, universities, political associations, social organizations, sport associations) becoming

influential zones of interaction and cultural exchange. In the process, some religious minorities became more visible and politically relevant, marking their presence in the urban fabric with beautiful and majestic religious buildings, which in turn were supported by policies of architectural inclusion and urban restyling. Individual agents, among which many women, gained more prominence, often as supporters of new religions that found in the city an ideal environment, especially among the rising bourgeoisie. In sum, this paper will try to assess to which extent, in the wake of modern 'secularities', different religious groups were more likely to share their religious life, assessing also, if possible, the shortcomings of rising national cultures that came to define the long nineteenth century.

---

Dionigi Albera

### **"Mixed sanctuaries and urban interspatiality: some Mediterranean examples"**

For several centuries, multi-religious attendance at sacred places by Christian and Muslim faithful has characterized the religious life in many Mediterranean towns. These phenomena had, and still have, a relevant impact on spatial dynamics. Adopting the terminology proposed by J. Lévy and M. Lussault, we may say that they generate specific forms of urban interspatiality.

These practices may be described as creative tactical appropriations of symbolic resources that emanate from strategic intentions and designs that political and religious organizations inscribe on the urban space. Mixed religious practices produce an in-betweenness that, in some respects, introduces a fluid dimension into rigid spatial regimes based on borders, boundaries, and mono-religious spatial scaling combining different hierarchical levels.

Borrowing some notions proposed by Marie-Louise Pratt, we may describe the shrines and the sanctuaries attracting a multireligious clientele as *contact zones*, with their specific "arts": they admit forms of copresence and interaction, and generate overlapping understandings and crisscrossing ritual performances. These practices and perceptions are not limited to the strict space of religious buildings, but invest other components of the surrounding landscape (water, stones, trees) and also include crucial visual elements.

In this paper I will discuss some types of interaction between these inter-religious spatializations and wider urban spatial dynamics. A first type is the *interstitial* space, which will be illustrated by the example of the *ayazma* (sacred water sources) in contemporary Istanbul. A second type is that of the *peripheral* space: a present-day huge pilgrimage from Istanbul to the neighboring island of Büyükada (involving dozen of thousands of Muslims and Christians) will offer an example of this form of inter-religious spatiality. A third type of inter-religious spatialization may be defined as *core* space: in some cases, sanctuaries that are known for admitting a mixed frequentation become a central symbol of the city. Adopting Lévy's terms, we may define them as *commutators*, allowing not only people with different backgrounds to mix, but also different spaces to interact, so generating processes of vertical *cospatialisation* (also defined by Lévy as *synchorisation*) of multiple spatial layers. I will discuss

these aspects by taking into account the contemporary examples of the sanctuaries of Notre-Dame d'Afrique in Algiers, and Notre-Dame de la Garde in Marseille.